

**MINUTES**  
**PERSONNEL COMMITTEE**

Tuesday, September 12, 2017

City Hall, Room 207

4:30 p.m.

Members Present: Ald. Steuer, Chair; Ald. Moore, Vice Chair, Ald. Sladek

Members Excused: Ald. DeWane

Others Present: Ald. Dorff, Ald. Nennig, Ald. Zima, Director Boland, Director Grenier, Chief Smith, Director Ellenbecker, Attorney Chavez, City Clerk Teske, Purchasing Manager Jensen, HR Operations Manager Falk and others

1. Roll call.

2. Adoption of the Agenda.

A motion to adopt the amended agenda and move item 9 after 4 was made by Ald. Sladek, seconded by Ald. Moore. Motion passed 3-0.

3. Approval of the minutes from the August 8, 2017 meeting.

A motion to approve the minutes from the August 8, 2017 meeting was made by Ald. Moore and seconded by Ald. Sladek. Motion passed 3-0.

4. Presentation by Dr. Karl Nollenberger, Associate Professor Emeritus at UW-Oshkosh, on City Manager/Administrator forms of government.

A motion to open the floor to Dr. Nollenberger was made by Ald. Moore and seconded by Ald. Sladek. Motion passed 3-0.

Dr. Nollenberger gave a presentation on various forms of government in Wisconsin and throughout the United States.

5. Consideration with possible action on request by Ald. Zima to review how minutes of meetings are taken and prepared for City Council.

Ald. Zima stated the City Clerk's office does a fantastic job with a small staff, but there is a noticeable difference in the minutes between the City and County board. Lately the minutes at the City have become almost meaningless where only the motions are included in the minutes without the discussion. Ald. Zima understands the meetings are available on tape, but who amongst us is going to go and watch all the tape from all the meetings. An alderperson's attention is generally focused on their committee and the varied responsibilities within their district. Minutes are very important when there is a subject of interest. They can and should be a great benefit because they bring other members up to speed on the pros and cons; or the difference of opinions that arise at the committee level. Ald. Zima stated minutes are an essential part of governing effectively and although there are budgetary considerations, this is one area the City has been

very lax. The difference between the City and County is the County Board actually has employees. The County Board has an internal auditor, and two full-time secretaries who take the minutes. The County minutes inform the reader in detail about the different opinions and questions. The City minutes are not useful at all because they only report the end result. Good minutes are essential to good governing. There is resistance to providing more detail minutes due to lack of personnel. Ald. Zima would like to consider adding personnel to the Clerk's office during the budget process to do the Council's work or look at contracting someone to do the minutes. Minutes are important; and not every single word needs to be reported, but wherever there's contention, the minutes should report both sides. For example, at a recent Protection and Welfare meeting a gentleman had a very difficult time answering basic questions and was contradicting himself, but the minutes only indicated Ald. Zima asked questions; the minutes didn't report what and how the individual answered.

Ald. Sladek indicated he's not familiar with the County Board minutes and asked for clarification on what Ald. Zima is seeking, whether it's for the City Council minutes to look more like the committee minutes, which Ald. Sladek finds to be pretty helpful, or for all minutes to be more extensive including the Council minutes.

Ald. Zima stated some committee minutes are better than others, but often times they are a very pale representation of what went on at the meeting. Ald. Zima looks forward to the minutes as they help prepare him for the Council meetings. When detail isn't included in the minutes, the Council has to start over asking questions and ends up doing committee work on the Council floor.

Ald. Sladek finds the committee minutes go far beyond what's just proposed and what the vote is; there's discussion and you can see when there has been questions or challenges.

Ald. Zima said there isn't enough staff to really do justice to the minutes.

Ald. Sladek is more interested in getting to the quality needed for the minutes rather than staff at this time.

Ald. Zima stated capturing accurate discussion in detail is very important on certain matters. A lot of the work the Council does is routine, but certain subjects require more detail in order to capture the flavor. Ald. Zima can provide examples of good minutes such as the ones from an advisory board at the County.

Ald. Sladek finds the City Council minutes are not very useful. Ald. Sladek agrees having more complete Council minutes would be helpful.

Ald. Zima stated the current Council minutes are just summaries of action taken. The committee reports are the backup for that discussion and those reports need more detail. Ald. Zima is not here to point fingers or find fault; the Clerk's staff does an outstanding job for the resources they have. Good minutes make good government.

Ald. Steuer noted the County has two secretaries that do the minutes for all their committees, but at the City, the minutes are taken by employees within a particular office, with the reasoning being those employees understand the dynamics of that particular office. For example, Ald. Steuer receives minutes from Historic Preservation from employees who are involved with historic preservation. Ald. Steuer asked if the two secretaries at the County are that adept that they can do all the committees.

Ald. Zima stated they are full-time employees, and that's basically what they do. The City Clerk's office has a lot more responsibilities than just preparing agendas and minutes for the Council. Ald. Zima feels the City needs to look at adding staff in the Clerk's office that would be accountable for Council meeting work. Ald. Zima would like to see a recommendation in the budget to add staff.

Ald. Steuer inquired if there's a way to determine the amount of time City office staff spend doing minutes. Ald. Zima stated it doesn't matter how much time is spent, the City has to spend the time to do the minutes. If it takes too much time then staff needs to be added to do the minutes. The best discussions at the Council come from well informed alderpersons.

Ald. Moore noted that over the last 20 years most industries have tried to go paperless, and have been gearing toward less paper and more electronic. All the meetings are video recorded now, and it would be helpful if the videos were summarized with a time stamp. Then the individual is getting the minutes word for word without having to print anything off, or having the minutes summarized and paying the extra payroll.

Ald. Zima agrees that would be beneficial, but there is no substitute for the written word on paper. It takes skill to prepare minutes and it should be rewarded appropriately. The electronic version is not a substitute for the written word.

Ald. Sladek said Ald. Moore's idea to time stamp the video recordings would facilitate the ease of seeing and hearing what the discussion was and better capture the flavor than words on paper.

Ald. Zima stated when something in the minutes gets your interest; then you can search and see exactly what was said. Everything done electronically is fantastic, but it's not a substitute for the minute taking that helps us efficiently make our decisions at the meetings. Reporting only the motions should not become the standard for committee minutes.

Ald. Dorff recognizes it would be convenient for alders to have the minutes, but is not sure what service this provides the public. Ald. Dorff believes this would be a redundancy and as a steward of the taxpayer's money there are two ways to get this information; either come to the committee meetings to hear what's going on or watch the committee videos. It's relatively easy to fast forward to the agenda item of interest. Ald. Dorff is opposed to hiring more personnel and spending that

kind of money to take minutes when there are other ways for alders to get the information and get the flavor of what's being said.

Ald. Moore stated if the City is going to add staff, we need to take a good look at where staffing is needed. Ald. Moore feels there are better places to add staff than taking minutes. The City can utilize the existing staff and maybe put different expectations for completing the minutes, such as time stamps. Ald. Moore indicated time stamps are a part of the new technology coming in. The City has a good opportunity to make a really great website that is not just a resource to the public but for us as well. Everyone needs to be giving Mr. Hronek input on the new website. Ald. Moore believes the minutes will be taken care of with the new website.

Ald. Zima stated alders represent their constituents and need as much information as possible. The form Ald. Moore is suggesting is great when you know what to look for, but otherwise there is nothing to draw your attention to the item.

Attorney Chavez stated a memo was included in the packet regarding the City's obligations as far as taking minutes. The only thing the City is obligated to do is keep a record of the motion and the votes. How we do that is entirely up to the City; it's actually under the Clerk's purview to decide that because it falls within her duties. As long as the City has a record the open meetings act is complied with per the Department of Justice (DOJ). The DOJ has stated a video tape or recording is sufficient. There is no requirement to do written minutes.

Clerk Teske stated transcription industry standards dictate that 10 to 15 minutes of speech takes one hour to type. For example, the Oval Office portion of the Protection and Welfare meeting was 67 minutes long, which would take at least five hours to transcribe. The P&W minutes ended up being 7½ pages, which means the minutes weren't summarized but included detail. Staff isn't trained to transcribe, they don't go to the meetings anymore; they just transcribe from the tape. The Clerk's office doesn't have the staff to do verbatim minutes and it's not only the Clerk's office. The issue is some are doing very short minutes, and P&W actually does the longest minutes, and that's the one being discussed. There has to be uniformity. The legislative management system the City is implementing will do exactly what Ald. Moore said. Each item will have a link to click that will take you right to the item on the video. The minutes will include the votes and the motion. The Clerk's office has books that go back to almost 1900 for Council. If someone wants to know when prohibition was, a staff member has to sit and go through every single book to find the information. With the new system you'll be able to type in "bike trail" for example and the system will bring up every single instance that bike trail was talked about. Another issue is deciding what topic is most important and should be transcribed verbatim. Clerk Teske spoke with the County and they do have two people who do the committee minutes and that's all they do, but they are pushing to go away from that and go with a system like the one the City is going to.

Ald. Steuer asked how many individuals are doing minutes in City Hall. Clerk Teske stated there are 29 different meetings, if it takes 5 hours to transcribe 1-hour and there are 25 hours of meetings every two weeks, contracted out at \$20/hour would cost \$65,000 per year.

Ald. Sladek stated Ald. Zima is dissatisfied with things the way they are, and agreed that Ald. Zima is not looking for word for word transcription. Ald. Sladek asked for an example of appropriate minutes.

Ald. Zima stated the City is moving towards only reporting the motions and go look on line for the detail. It's not a useful way for us to efficiently operate as decision makers.

Following further discussion, a motion to request that the IT Administrator and City Clerk make a presentation of the new meeting minute's program at a subsequent meeting was made by Ald. Sladek and seconded by Ald. Moore. Motion passed 3-0.

6. Consideration with possible action on request to fill the following replacement positions and all subsequent vacancies resulting from internal transfers.
  - a. Maintenance & Enforcement Attendant – Public Works
  - b. Appraiser II – Administrative Services

A motion to approve the request to fill the requests as presented was made by Ald. Sladek and seconded by Ald. Moore.

Ald. Steuer asked whether the MEA position is fully funded through parking citations. Director Grenier replied all positions within the parking division with the exception of the Parking Superintendent and Operations Director are fully funded through parking revenues.

Ald. Steuer inquired if there are other positions throughout the City funded by citations or non-tax revenues. Director Boland responded there are a number of positions that are not funded by the general fund. A report was prepared a couple of months ago at Ald. Nicholson's request that showed the funding source for each position.

Motion passed 3-0.

7. Consideration with possible action on the following:
  - a. Request to reclassify the part-time (0.5) exempt Business Grant Manager position at Pay Grade I (\$52,728 - \$71,323) to a full-time (1.0) non-exempt Financial Analyst position at Pay Grade G (\$44,179 - \$55,779) at a projected annual cost increase of \$26,999. This position is fully funded by the general fund.
  - b. Request approval to fill this position and all subsequent vacancies resulting from internal transfers.

Ald. Moore asked what the difference is between the two positions. Director Boland stated there is a difference in responsibilities for the positions. Job responsibilities, requirements, education and expectations for the Business Grant Manager position were more versus the Financial Analyst. The Financial Analyst is an hourly position. This position will no longer be shared between Finance and Transit like the Business Grant Manager position.

Director Ellenbecker stated the Business Grant Manager position was created at the recommendation of the auditors about 4-years ago. Ald. Sladek inquired if a mistake was made creating the Business Grant Manager position. Director Ellenbecker indicated no mistake was made; someone came in, streamlined the process and worked very well with the other departments to roll up all the grants. The departments are meeting their deadlines and timelines. It did take a half-time position to do the work that was recommended by the auditors. The half-time Business Grant Manager position for Finance worked on grants, other projects, and also helped implement the new ERP system. The new ERP system is now in place and things are running smooth. Ms. Manley has kept some of the higher end grant items. Some of the grant spreadsheets, collecting paperwork, organizing will go to the Financial Analyst position. There is also a list of 20 plus projects that are currently being done by the Assistant Finance Director or Finance Director for spreadsheet work, ongoing weekly and monthly reports that an analyst could pull reports together. The goal is to shift the dollars that were put in the budget to help do regular ongoing projects.

Ald. Moore asked if there is a reason to leave this position as is until the end of the fiscal year in order to have a cost savings. Director Ellenbecker indicated the department is down a half-time position and getting further behind.

Ald. Sladek inquired if there was a way to organize the work for a half-time position. Director Ellenbecker responded yes, and asked the committee to consider a .65 FTE which would be equivalent to the dollar amount of the .5 Business Grant Manager.

A motion to approve reclassifying the part-time (.5) Business Grant Manager position to a part-time (.65) non-exempt Financial Analyst at Pay Grade G (\$44,179-\$55,779) and approve request to fill and all subsequent vacancies as a result of internal transfers was made by Ald. Moore and seconded by Ald. Sladek. Motion passed 3-0.

8. Consideration with possible action on out-of-state travel requests.

- a. Development Specialist to attend the Mayors Conference on Entrepreneurship in Oakland, California, October 25-28, 2017 at no cost to the City for room, board or transportation.

A motion to approve the request as presented was made by Ald. Sladek and seconded by Ald. Moore. Motion passed 3-0.

- b. Public Works Laborer to attend American Public Works Association (APWA) National Snow Plow "Rodeo" in Fort Collins, CO, September 26 – 28, 2017, estimated cost for meals \$75.

Director Boland stated Public Works employee, Darren Olson placed first in the State and will be representing the City of Green Bay and the State of Wisconsin at the National Rodeo.

A motion to approve the request as presented by Ald. Sladek and seconded by Ald. Moore. Motion passed 3-0.

9. Consideration with possible action on request to award a three year contract for management of the City's Flexible Spending Accounts (FSA), Personal Benefit Accounts (PBA), Post-Employment PBA, COBRA and Retiree Escrow Prepaid Card to Benefit Advantage for a projected annual cost of \$56,683 (total for 3 years \$170,049) effective January 1, 2018. Rates for the first three years are guaranteed. The City reserves the right to extend the contract for two additional 1-year periods by mutual consent, subject to prevailing rates.

Purchasing Manager Jensen helped facilitate this process which was originally done by the Green Bay School District. Director Boland was working with the City's insurance consultant M3 and asked to piggyback on the work the school district had done. After review, it was determined the City had different needs than the school district. The City re-interviewed all of the finalists for the school district and asked them to requote based on the City's need. The recommendation is to contract with Benefit Advantage at a projected annual cost of \$56,683 which results in an overall savings.

A motion to approve the request as presented was made by Ald. Moore and seconded by Ald. Sladek. Motion passed 3-0.

10. Request by Ald. Sladek to review the Police Department table of organization.

A motion to receive and place on file the review of the Police Department table of organization was made by Ald. Sladek and seconded by Ald. Moore. Motion passed 3-0.

11. Request by Ald. Steuer for a summary report of exit survey.

Director Boland explained that exit surveys have been done online since 2014. The report shows the number and percentage of retirements and resignations each year along with the turnover rate for each. The overall turnover rate has been very low. The exit survey is voluntary and not everyone completes the survey.

A motion to receive and place on file the summary exit survey report was made by Ald. Sladek and seconded by Ald. Moore.

12. Consideration with possible action on the following:

- a. Request to approve wage agreement between the City of Green Bay and International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers (IBEW) Local 158 with a 2% general salary increase effective with the start of the pay period in which October 1, 2017 occurs.

A motion to approve the wage agreement between the City of Green Bay and IBEW with a 2% general salary increase effective with the start of the pay period in which October 1, 2017 occurs was made by Ald. Sladek and seconded by Ald. Moore. Motion passed 3-0.

- b. Request to approve the collective bargaining agreement with City of Green Bay Fire Fighters Local 141, upon expiration of the current agreement for a 2-year term (January 1, 2018 through December 31, 2019) with a 2% wage increase effective July 1, 2018 and 2% wage increase effective July 1, 2019.

A motion to approve the collective bargaining agreement with the City of Green Bay Fire Fighters as presented was made by Ald. Sladek and seconded by Ald. Moore. Motion passed 3-0.

10. Consideration with possible action on report of Routine Personnel Actions for regular employees.

A motion to receive and place on file the report of Routine Personnel Actions for regular employees was made by Ald. Sladek and seconded by Ald. Moore. Motion passed 3-0.

There being no further business, a motion was made by Ald. Moore and seconded by Ald. Sladek to adjourn at 6:20 p.m. Motion passed 3-0.